

24

Public Ex
#8



In the Matter of an Otter Tail Power Company and Partners Application for a Route Permit for the Big Stone 230 kV and 345 kV Transmission Lines Project in Southwestern Minnesota

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT SCOPING DECISION

PUC Docket No. E017, et al/CN-05-619
PUC Docket No. E017, et al/TR-05-1275

The above matter has come before the Commissioner of the Department of Commerce (the Department) for a decision on the Scope of the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) to be prepared on the proposed Big Stone High Voltage Transmission Line (HVTL) project affecting Stevens, Big Stone, Swift, Kandiyohi, Lac Qui Parle, Chippewa and Yellow Medicine counties in Southwestern Minnesota.

The Public Utilities Commission (PUC) states in its November 29, 2005, *Order Agreeing To Combining the Environmental Report and Environmental Impact Statement Document*, that the Department should prepare an EIS *in lieu* of the Environmental Report (ER) normally required for the Certificate of Need (CON). The PUC has directed the Department to prepare the single EIS document in order to streamline the process for the Applicants and other parties and to assist the public participation process. The Department will include in the EIS the analysis of alternatives that would have been required under the ER.

The Energy Facilities Permitting (EFP) Unit of the Department held public meetings on January 24-26, 2006, in Benson, Morris, Ortonville, Canby and Granite Falls to discuss the project with the public and to solicit input into the scope of the EIS to be prepared. The public was given until February 13, 2006, to submit written comments regarding the scope of the EIS.

Having reviewed the matter, and having consulted with the EFP staff, I hereby make the following Scoping Order:

MATTERS TO BE ADDRESSED

The Environmental Impact Statement will address the following matters:

For the purposes of clarity and completeness, the EIS will be divided into two major sections. Part One will include a description and analysis of human and environmental impacts of the proposed project and alternatives that would have been required by Minnesota Rule 4410.7035 under an Environmental Report for the Certificate of Need. This section will evaluate the matters of size, type and timing that would not normally be included in an EIS for a route permit application. Part Two will address the human and environmental impacts of the proposed routes

in the Permit Application and other impacts identified by public comments received through the scoping process as required under Minnesota Rules 4400.1700.

To manage the bulk of the EIS document, the EIS will summarize the information in the permit application where possible and verify, supplement and incorporate the information by reference as appropriate. The document may also reference the Federal EIS in the same manner.

INTRODUCTION

1.0 SUMMARY OF THE BIG STONE TRANSMISSION PROJECT

- 1.1 Project Description
- 1.2 Project Location
- 1.3 Project Purpose
- 1.4 Project Alternatives
- 1.5 Sources of Information

2.0 REGULATORY FRAMEWORK

- 2.1 PUC Certificate of Need
- 2.2 PUC Permit Requirement
- 2.3 Scoping of Environmental Impacts and Alternative Routes
- 2.4 Environmental Impact Statement Requirement

BOOK ONE: ALTERNATIVES TO THE TRANSMISSION PROJECT

The EIS will consider only alternatives that could have an impact on transmission in Minnesota. For example, an alternate generation option in the same location and of the same output as proposed would not be considered, as it would not materially affect the transmission requested for the project. The South Dakota Public Utilities Commission generation permit application process and the review thereof by the Western Area Power Administration Federal EIS are considering the generation alternatives at the proposed Big Stone II plant. These agencies are reviewing generation alternatives that would meet the applicants' proposed energy, capacity and timeline using a different fuel, plant design, pollution equipment, location or even timeline.

Alternatives analyzed under this EIS will be alternatives to the applicants' proposed transmission facilities. The Department will evaluate alternatives that provide an equal amount of energy and capacity as proposed by the applicants. Such alternatives may attempt to reduce, mitigate or eliminate the need for the applicants' proposed transmission lines, while delivering the proposed "needed" energy to load centers. Any analysis of the alleged need will be conducted through the CON process generally and not specifically under the EIS. The EIS will focus on the environmental, social, economic and cultural impacts of any alternatives that would affect the implementation of high voltage transmissions lines in Minnesota as related to this project.

This analysis will review the impacts and mitigation measures for the following alternatives: The first is the proposed transmission project in the application, including the assumption of the

Big Stone II Plant expansion. The second is a no build option, in which transmission in Minnesota would not be built, even under a scenario in which the plant expansion had occurred. A third option is a renewables/gas option, where the proposed generation and transmission plan has been replaced by renewable electric generation, possibly including wind, biomass or other renewable technologies, coupled with a natural gas component to compensate for renewables' natural limitations to fulfill base load requirements. The fourth option would examine distributed generation options that may actually eliminate the need for transmission options. This option will also incorporate demand side management and other conservation improvement program opportunities.

3.0 HUMAN AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS

3.1 Right-of-Way Requirements [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 3, A]

- 3.1.1 Big Stone Transmission Project**
- 3.1.2 No Build Option**
- 3.1.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation**
- 3.1.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management**

3.2 Anticipated Size and Type of Structures [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 3, B]

- 3.2.1 Big Stone Transmission Project**
- 3.2.2 No Build Option**
- 3.2.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation**
- 3.2.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management**

3.3 Electric and Magnetic Fields [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 3, C]

- 3.3.1 Big Stone Transmission Project**
- 3.3.2 No Build Option**
- 3.3.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation**
- 3.3.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management**

3.4 Anticipated Noise Impacts [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 3, D]

- 3.4.1 Big Stone Transmission Project**
- 3.4.2 No Build Option**
- 3.4.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation**
- 3.4.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management**

3.5 Anticipated Visual Impacts [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 3, E]

- 3.5.1 Big Stone Transmission Project**
- 3.5.2 No Build Option**
- 3.5.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation**
- 3.5.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management**

- 3.6 Anticipated Emissions of any Hazardous Air Pollutants and VOCs
 - 3.6.1 Big Stone Transmission Project
 - 3.6.2 No Build Option
 - 3.6.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation
 - 3.6.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management
- 3.7 Anticipated Impacts on Water Quality
 - 3.7.1 Big Stone Transmission Project
 - 3.7.2 No Build Option
 - 3.7.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation
 - 3.7.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management
- 3.8 Anticipated Impacts on Natural and Wildlife Resources
 - 3.8.1 Big Stone Transmission Project
 - 3.8.2 No Build Option
 - 3.8.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation
 - 3.8.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management
- 3.9 Anticipated Social and Economic Impacts
 - 3.9.1 Big Stone Transmission Project
 - 3.9.2 No Build Option
 - 3.9.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation
 - 3.9.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management
- 4.0 MITIGATION MEASURES [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 1, E]
 - 4.1 Big Stone Transmission Project
 - 4.2 No Build Option
 - 4.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation
 - 4.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management
- 5.0 FEASIBILITY AND AVAILABILITY OF ALTERNATIVES [Minn. Rule 4410.7035, subp. 1, F]
 - 5.1 Big Stone Transmission Project
 - 5.2 No Build Option
 - 5.3 Wind/Renewables and Gas Generation
 - 5.4 Distributed Generation/Demand Side Management

BOOK TWO: IMPACTS OF TRANSMISSION ROUTES

This Analysis will review the proposed preferred and alternative routes as described in the Big Stone Transmission Project Route Permit Application. Only one comment was received that

suggested an alternative route. The recommendation was to "go south on Highway 7 on state wildlife land from Ortonville all the way to Appleton...." The suggested "Highway 7 Route" has not been accepted for further study in the EIS, as it falls within a possible corridor rejected in the Western Area Power Administration Administrative Draft EIS. The remaining route variations suggested in public comments will not be examined separately in this EIS document. They do not fall outside the proposed 2,000-foot route proposals received from the applicants and therefore will already be included in the overall route analysis.

The analysis will review the impacts below for each of the eight route alternatives (there are two proposals that fall within each of four separate corridors). In the route permit process, the PUC will choose one route from the two within the Canby to Granite Falls corridor; and one route from the four within the Ortonville to Morris corridor and the Ortonville to Wilmar corridor. The PUC may also choose one route from the two in the Ortonville to Canby corridor as an alternative to a route west of the South Dakota border.

6.0 ASSESSMENT OF IMPACTS AND MITIGATION

6.1 Description of Environmental Setting

6.2 Rejected "Highway 7 Route" Option

6.3 Impacts on Human Settlement

6.3.1 Socioeconomic

6.3.2 Displacement

6.3.3 Noise

6.3.4 Aesthetics

6.3.5 Human Health and Safety

6.4 Impacts on Land-based Economics

6.4.1 Recreation

6.4.2 Prime Farmland

6.4.3 Transportation

6.4.4 Mining and Forestry

6.4.5 Economic Development

6.4.5 Archeological and Historic Resources

6.5 Impacts on Natural Environment

6.5.1 Air Quality

6.5.2 Water Quality, Soils and Geology

6.5.3 Groundwater and Wetlands

6.5.4 Fish and Wildlife Resources

6.5.5 Vegetation

6.6 Rare and Unique Natural Resources

7.0 OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

- 7.1 Significant Unavoidable Adverse Impacts
- 7.2 Irreversible/Irretrievable Commitment of Resources

8.0 PERMITS AND APPROVALS REQUIRED

- 8.1 Federal
- 8.2 State
- 8.3 Local

ISSUES OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THE EIS

The Draft Environment Impact State will not consider the following matters:

1. The manner in which land owners are paid for transmission right-of-way easements, as that is outside the PUC route permitting jurisdiction.
2. Any consideration of generation alternatives or substitutions at the proposed Big Stone II plant site in South Dakota.
3. Any additional transmission lines or substations not proposed in the application or by the public, but needed for additional wind or other generation outlet capacity.

SCHEDULE

The Draft EIS shall be completed by June 30, 2006. Following public information meetings and the Public Hearings, a Final EIS will be available by December 1, 2006.

Signed this 28 day of Feb, 2006

STATE OF MINNESOTA
DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE


Glenn Wilson, Commissioner

017, et.al/TR-05-1275

Robert Amundson
13665 610th Ave
Chokio MN 56271

Tom Belmont
38118 N Shore Dr
Battle Lake MN 56515

Nate Burmeister
61743 St Hwy 28
Chokio MN 56221

Dennis Anderson
2505 Willmar Ave SW
Willmar MN 56201

Dale Berg
4006 220th Ave
Clarkfield MN 56223

John Burmeister
61743 St Hwy 28
Chokio MN 56221

Robert Anderson
465 35th Ave SW
Benson MN 56215

David & Gladys Bever
465 150th Ave NW
Holloway MN 56249

Leon Carlson
PO Box 26
Olivia MN 56277

Ron Anderson
PO Box 195
Milan MN 56262

Gary and Margaret Blahosky
113 Cantibury Rd
Circle Pines MN 55014

Dale Champ
212 9th Ave SE
Elbow Lake MN 56531

Scott Anderson
1303 E Bridge St Ste 130
Redwood Falls MN 56283

Max Blair
6385 Old Shady Oak Rd
Eden Prairie MN 55344

Bryan Clark
1884 Hwy 40
Madison MN 56256

Robynn Andracssek
9400 Ward Pkwy
Kansas City MO 64114

Velma Blomgren
49196 220th St
Morris MN 56267

Christopher Cole
911 W 4th St
Morris MN 56267

Randy Ascherman
1930 20th St SW
Appleton MN 56208

Jon Boese
1160 20th St NW
Holloway MN 56249

John Connolly
849 Hwy 12 WW
Danvers MN 56231

Eldeen Baer
108 Orleans Ave N
Canby MN 56220

John Boots
67437 Cnty Hwy 14
Odessa MN 56276

Dave Cragmile
3600 140th St
Boye MN 56218

John Baker
655 150th Ave SW
Appleton MN 56208

R Buer
1113 Meadow Hills Ave
Madison MN 56256

Troy Denelsbecht
2405 200th St
Canby MN 56220

LaVerne Dering
212 3rd St N
Correll MN 56227

Jim Falk
1170 Hwy 9 NE
Murdock MN 56271

Glenn Guhud
2471 240th Ave
Canby MN 56220

Terri Dinesen
1623 9th Ave
Granite Falls MN 56241

Andrew Falk
1170 Hwy 9 NE
Murdock MN 56271

Tom & Sandy Gunter
1060 120th Ave NE
Clara City MN 56222

Rose Doom
2902 240th Ave
Canby MN 56220

Patty Farmr
2471 240th Ave
Canby MN 56220

Arlan Gustafson
5110 230th Ave
Granite Falls MN 56241

Nate Duoss
Builders Association of the Twin Cities
2960 Centre Point Dr
Roseville MN 55113

Ted Favirchild
2063 120th St
Canby MN 56220

Carl Haase
712 Bluff St Box 266
Graceville MN 57240

Gary Ehrenberg
180 220 Ave SW
Appleton MN 56208

Annalee Garletz
AMC
125 Chars Ave
St Paul MN 55102

Richard Haherman
4547 368th Ave
Montevideo MN 56265

Richard Ehrenberg
41373 Cnty Hwy 25
Correll MN 56227

Erica Gatzow
8 Meadow Ln
Morris MN 56267

Howard Hallman
58874 St Hwy 28
Chokio MN 56221

Audie Ekas
70001 US Hwy 75
Odessa MN 56276

Karon Gerdes
7020 120th Ave NE
Kerkhoven MN 56252

Harley Hamernon
325 20th Rd
Benson MN 56282

Glenn Emmons
207 Rins Ave S
Canby MN 56220

Doug Gronholz
2355 20th NW
Appleton MN 56208

Roger Hanson
201 Garden St
Duluth MN 55812

Mexll & Rose Epencer
26 SE 4th Ave
Clear City MN

Don Groth
5420 135th St NW
Kerkhaven MN 56252

David Hanson
1416 10th St
Clarkfield MN 56223

Doris Hanson
1147 4th St
Boyd MN 56241

Bruce Hoernemann
71582 Cnty Rd 64
Ortonville MN 56278

Gary Johnson
4767 330th
Montevideo MN 56265

Arden & Julnn Hanson
105 Buckeyes Dr
Montevideo MN 56265

Tom Hoffman
1005 Oakwood Ave
Benson MN 56215

Bryan Kallhoff
1588 130th St N
Canby MN 56220

Richard & Sue Hauer
830 Why 12 SE
DeGraff MN 56271

Andrea Hoffman
717 Lyndale Ave
Morris MN 56267

John Karstraup
2455 151st St
Madison MN 56256

Joe Hauger
116 Baldwin St No 7
Granite Falls MN 56241

Virginia Homme
11007 810th Ave
Granite Falls MN 56241

Craig Kausting
1449 250th St
Madison MN 56256

Tammy & Jerry Heinrich
2664 201st Ave
Madison MN 56256

Barbara Hoyhtyes
110 Oscar Ave
Canby MN 56220

Cesia Kearns
Sierra Club
2327 E Franklin Ave Ste 1
Minneapolis MN 55406

Gary Henneberg
445 130th Ave SW
Holloway MN 56249

Tim Hunstad
HMG LLC
4165 Shorewood Trail
Medina MN 55340

Carol Kopperud
401 LacQue Parle A
Canby MN 56220

Judy Hoberg
435 Hwy 12 SW
Benson MN 56215

Alex D Iden
13040 60th Ave SW
Raymond MN 56282

Grant Krieger
1095 165th Ave SE
Kerkhoven MN 56252

Joseph Hocum
108 9th St W
Canby MN 56220

Kim Jergenson
1212 Parkside Dr
Marshall MN 56258

Dick Kroger
2067 530th St
Woodlake MN 56297

Arthur Hoeremen
557 4th Ave
Ortonville MN 56278

George Johnson
1946 Larpenteur Ave E
St Paul MN 55109

Gordon Kruse
1430 110th St N
Canby MN 56220

Art Larson
1610 230th Ave
Canby MN 56220

James & Helen McNally
6105 Main
Chokio MN 56221

James Murphy
734833 Cnty Why 13
Graceville MN 56240

Gary Lentz
2148 620th St
Echo MN 56237

Chris Miguez
Universal Ensco
4848 Loop Central
Houston TX 77081

Bob Narem
14313 469th
Twin Brook SD 57269

David Linde
1561 680th Ave
Ortonville MN 56278

Lewis Miller
109 8th St W
Canby MN 56220

Day Neal
6080 60th Ave NE
Murdock MN 56271

Rod Lindquist
1780 90th St SE
Kerkhoven MN 56252

Raymond Millett
511 20th N
Benson MN 56215

Constance Netter
Electrical Builders Inc
8972 Main Ave PO Box 299
Clear Lake MN 55319

Linda Lorenzen-Groth
5420 135th St NW
Kerkhoven MN 56252

Alan Mitchell
Lindquist & Vennum Inc
4200 IDS Center
80 S Eighth St
Minneapolis 55402

Duane Ninneman
PO Box 154
Ortonville MN 56278

Harold Luthi
26490 Hwy 59
Morris MN 56267

Gordie Molenoon
6045 Kaniio Chip Line
Raymond MN 56287

Gerry & Burt Nygren
228 N Grace St
Ortonville MN 56278

Jacqueline Maas
69266 430th St
Odessa MN 56276

Kevin Molloy
MPCA
520 Lafayette Rd N
St Paul MN 55155

Bill Ogey
870 70th St SW
Danvers MN 56231

Pam Mansfield
1210 Hwy 12
Murdock MN 56215

Dan Morrill
67702 280th St
Clinton MN 56225

Brent Olson
67804 Cnty Hwy 8
Ortonville MN 56278

Curt Marcus
Marcus Financial
1609 NW 16th Ave
Willmar MN 56201

Gordon Mueller
1123 390th St
Ortonville MN 56278

Suzanne Pansch
38479 Hwy 12
Ortonville MN 56278

Todd Patza
1617 161st Ave
Marietta MN 50257

Mike Prukop
2486 170th St
Canby MN 56220

Ken Rupp
977 15th St
Granite Falls MN 56241

Dean Pawlowski
Otter Tail Power Co
215 S Cascade St
Fergus Falls MN 56538

Lewis Rademach
3642 121st Ave
Bellingham MN 56212

Kathy Rupp
1060 Hwy 12 SW
Danvers MN 56231

Pearl & Ervin Pederson
Box 6108
Bellingham MN 56212

Glen Rademach
1477 330th St
Bellingham MN 56212

Brian Ruppe
1060 Why 12 SW
Danvers MN 56231

Harold or Kyle Petersen
8090 Hwy 40 NE
Murdock MN 56271

A Radtler
65459 Cnty Hwy 14
Odessa MN 56276

Lila Salls
38742 State Hwy 7
Ortonville MN 56278

Robert Peterson
5280 Hwy 212
Granite Falls MN 56241

Dianne Radumach
619 Cliff St
Ortonville MN 56278

Rick Sand
5223 Hwy 212
Granite Falls MN 56241

Representative Aaron Peterson
1439 Hwy 75
Madison MN 56256

Warren Ran
2100 30th St NW
Appleton MN 56208

Allen Saunders
555 10th St SE
Benson MN 56215

Gary Petrucci
2975 Cnty Rd 24
Long Lake MN 55356

Erin Jordahl Redlin
308 E Hennepin Ave
Minneapolis MN 55414

Carla Schellberg
38790 Cnty Hwy 12
Ortonville MN 56278

Paul Pillatzki
1895 255th Ave W
Dawson MN 56232

Ross Reiffenberge
304 22nd St S
St Cloud MN 56301

Keith & Mary Schirm
138 W Thielke Ave No 3
Appleton MN 56208

Angela Piner
HDR Engineering Inc
6190 Golden Hills Dr
Minneapolis MN 55416

Steve Rupp
1194 6th St
Granite Falls MN 56241

Wayne Schmidgolf
4 Bluebird Ct
Morris MN 56267

Ron Schmidt
43176 Cnty Hwy 36
Correll MN 56227

Joe Stesig
1085 50th St SW
Danvers MN 56231

Paul Theisen
1280 121st Ave N
Canby MN 56220

Ron Schneider
355 Lake Ave N
Spicer MN 56288

Esther Steuck
23036 590th Ave
Chokio MN 56221

Greg Thompson
66995 Cnty Hwy 10
Ortonville MN 56278

Anthony Schnitler
1160 20th NW
Davers MN 56231

Jim Stone
1310 220th Ave
Canby MN 56220

Richard Thompson
34671 680th Ave
Ortonville MN 56278

Bill Schuna
PO Box 111
Marshall MN 56258

Harold Strei
436 Eastvold Ave
Ortonville MN 56278

Jim Thoreen
PO Box 530
Morris MN 56267

Roxanne Shekleton
1015 110th St SE
Murdock MN 56271

Mary Jo Stueve
518 St Joseph Ave PO Box 30
Graceville MN 56240

Jim Threceses
2753 120th
Canby MN 56220

Dean Shurb
16281 140th St NW
Sanburg MN 56289

Jeffry Swenson
1140 60th Ave SE
DeGraff MN 56271

Mitch Toftg
1110 130th Ave SE
Kerkhoven MN 56252

Lowell Simpson
14622 60th Ave
Chokio MN 56221

R Taffe
40 Greenwood
Ortonville MN 56278

Terry VanDerPel
235 7th Ave
Granite Falls MN 56241

Galen Skjefte
2889 490th St
Granite Falls MN 56241

Steven Thayer
510 150th Ave SE
Kerkhaven MN 56252

Marlyn & Dorothy Vangness
42072 Cnty Hwy 36
Correll MN 56227

Steven Stamp
1920 121 Avemie
Marietta MN 56257

Jon Theisen
1592 100th St N
Canby MN 56220

Jeffrey Vascoe
314 Hauffager Ave
Canby MN 56220

Sandy Wadsworth
1101 E 145th St
Burnsville MN 55337

Don Wodek
ENSR Corporation
4500 Park Glen Rd Ste 210
St Louis Park MN 55416

Tim Walsh
955 15th Ave SE
Benson MN 56215

Brian Wojtalenicz
139 N Miles St
Appleton MN 56208

Tom Walsh
705 100th St SE
DeGraff MN 56271

~~Robert Wolfington
508 W Main~~

Chuck J Walters
68937 240th St
Graceville MN 56240

Ben Wulff
67353 240th
Johnson MN 56236

Bruce Wellendorf
36564 640th St
Ortonville MN 56278

Pete Wykoff
1111 Park Ave
Morris MN 56267

Craig Wersing
590 30th St SW
Danvers MN 56208

Dean Young
10121 120th St NW
Pennock MN 56279

Donald Wersing
590 30th St SW
Danvers MN 56231

Marshall Independent
Marshall MN 56258

Rita Wersinger
590 30th St SW
Danvers MN 56231

Don Wiese
60227 US Hwy 12
Correll MN 56227